Benefit and Cost Calculatio Discount rate

| Ben | efit and | d Cost Calculati | O Discount rate | Э | 7% | per year | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|---------|-------------|-------------------|-----------------|--------------|----------------|--------------|-------------|-------------|--------------|--------------------|-------------|----------------|-------------|--------------|-----------|------------|----------|--------------|---------------|--------------|--------------|-------------|---------------|
| | | | | | Cost | S | | | | | Benefits | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | Base | Case | | | | Project | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | (| Capital Mai | ntenance | Total | Capi | tal | Mainter | nance | Total | Net Project | Maintenance | e Cost Savings | Time S | avings | Fuel S | Savings | Accident | Savings | Job S | avings | Residua | al Value | Total Savings |
| Year | Actual | Discounted Actual | Discounted | Discountee | Actual | Discounted | Actual | Discounted | Discounted | Costs (Discounted) | Actual | Discounted | Actual | Discounted A | Actual | Discounted | Actual | Discounted A | ctual | Discounted | Actual | Discounted | (Discounted) |
| 2012 | 0 | \$500,00 | 0 \$500,00 | 0 \$500,00 | 0 \$15,300,000 | \$15,300,000 | \$500,000 | \$500,000 | \$15,800,000 | \$15,800,000 | \$0 |) \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | D | | \$0 |
| 2013 | 1 | \$500,00 | 0 \$467,29 | 9 \$467,29 | 0 \$16,100,000 | \$15,046,729 | \$450,000 | \$420,561 | \$15,467,290 | \$15,467,290 | \$50,000 | \$46,729 | \$15,751 | \$14,721 | \$5,071 | \$4,739 | \$12,911 | \$12,066 | \$0 | \$0 | D | | \$78,255 |
| 2014 | 2 | \$500,00 | 0 \$436,71 | 9 \$436,71 | 9 \$14,300,000 | \$12,490,174 | \$450,000 | \$393,047 | \$12,883,221 | \$12,883,221 | \$50,000 | \$43,672 | \$15,751 | \$13,758 | \$5,071 | \$4,429 | \$25,821 | \$22,553 | \$0 | \$0 | D | | \$84,412 |
| 2015 | 3 | \$500,00 | 0 \$408,14 | 9 \$408,14 | 9 \$400,000 | \$326,519 | \$250,000 | \$204,074 | \$530,594 | \$530,594 | \$250,000 | \$204,074 | \$78,756 | \$64,288 | \$25,353 | \$20,696 | \$39,123 | \$31,936 | \$8,936,805 | \$7,295,095 | 5 | | \$7,616,090 |
| 2016 | 4 | \$500,00 | 0 \$381,44 | 8 \$381,44 | 8 \$0 | \$0 | \$250,000 | \$190,724 | \$190,724 | \$190,724 | \$250,000 | \$190,724 | \$78,756 | \$60,082 | \$25,353 | \$19,342 | \$39,123 | \$29,847 | \$8,936,805 | \$6,817,846 | 6 | | \$7,117,841 |
| 2017 | 5 | \$500,00 | 0 \$356,49 | 3 \$356,49 | 3 | \$0 | \$250,000 | \$178,247 | \$178,247 | 7 \$178,247 | \$250,000 | \$178,247 | \$78,756 | \$56,152 | \$25,353 | \$18,076 | \$39,123 | \$27,894 | \$8,936,805 | \$6,371,819 | 9 | | \$6,652,188 |
| 2018 | 6 | \$500,00 | 0 \$333,17 | 1 \$333,17 | 1 | \$0 | \$250,000 | \$166,586 | \$166,586 | \$ \$166,586 | \$250,000 | \$166,586 | \$78,756 | \$52,478 | \$25,353 | \$16,894 | \$39,123 | \$26,070 | \$8,936,805 | \$5,954,97 | 1 | | \$6,216,998 |
| 2019 | 7 | \$500,00 | 0 \$311,37 | 5 \$311,37 | 5 | \$0 | \$250,000 | \$155,687 | \$155,687 | 7 \$155,687 | \$250,000 | \$155,687 | \$78,756 | \$49,045 | \$25,353 | \$15,789 | \$39,123 | \$24,364 | \$8,936,805 | \$5,565,393 | 3 | | \$5,810,278 |
| 2020 | 8 | \$500,00 | 0 \$291,00 | 5 \$291,00 | 5 | \$0 | \$250,000 | \$145,502 | \$145,502 | \$145,502 | \$250,000 | \$145,502 | \$78,756 | \$45,837 | \$25,353 | \$14,756 | \$39,123 | \$22,770 | \$8,936,805 | \$5,201,302 | 2 | | \$5,430,167 |
| 2021 | 9 | \$500,00 | 0 \$271,96 | 7 \$271,96 | 7 | \$0 | \$250,000 | \$135,983 | \$135,983 | \$135,983 | \$250,000 | \$135,983 | \$78,756 | \$42,838 | \$25,353 | \$13,790 | \$39,123 | \$21,280 | \$8,936,805 | \$4,861,030 |) | | \$5,074,922 |
| 2022 | 10 | \$500,00 | 0 \$254,17 | 5 \$254,17 | 5 | \$0 | \$250,000 | \$127,087 | \$127,087 | \$127,087 | \$250,000 | \$127,087 | \$78,756 | \$40,035 | \$25,353 | \$12,888 | \$39,123 | \$19,888 | \$8,936,805 | \$4,543,019 | 9 | | \$4,742,918 |
| 2023 | 11 | \$500,00 | 0 \$237,54 | 6 \$237,54 | 6 | \$0 | \$250,000 | \$118,773 | \$118,773 | 3 \$118,773 | \$250,000 | \$118,773 | \$78,756 | \$37,416 | \$25,353 | \$12,045 | \$39,123 | \$18,587 | \$8,936,805 | \$4,245,812 | 2 | | \$4,432,634 |
| 2024 | 12 | \$500,00 | 0 \$222,00 | 6 \$222,00 | 6 | \$0 | \$250,000 | \$111,003 | \$111,003 | 3 \$111,003 | \$250,000 | \$111,003 | \$78,756 | \$34,969 | \$25,353 | \$11,257 | \$39,123 | \$17,371 | \$8,936,805 | \$3,968,048 | 3 | | \$4,142,648 |
| 2025 | 13 | \$500,00 | 0 \$207,48 | 2 \$207,48 | 2 | \$0 | \$250,000 | \$103,741 | \$103,741 | \$103,741 | \$250,000 | \$103,741 | \$78,756 | \$32,681 | \$25,353 | \$10,521 | \$39,123 | \$16,235 | \$8,936,805 | \$3,708,456 | 6 | | \$3,871,634 |
| 2026 | 14 | \$500,00 | 0 \$193,90 | 9 \$193,90 | 9 | \$0 | \$250,000 | \$96,954 | \$96,954 | \$96,954 | \$250,000 | \$96,954 | \$78,756 | \$30,543 | \$25,353 | \$9,832 | \$39,123 | \$15,173 | \$8,936,805 | \$3,465,847 | | | \$3,618,349 |
| 2027 | 15 | \$500,00 | 0 \$181,22 | 3 \$181,22 | 3 | \$0 | \$250,000 | \$90,612 | \$90,612 | 2 \$90,612 | \$250,000 | \$90,612 | \$78,756 | \$28,545 | \$25,353 | \$9,189 | \$39,123 | \$14,180 | \$8,936,805 | \$3,239,109 | 9 | | \$3,381,635 |
| 2028 | 16 | \$500,00 | 0 \$169,36 | 7 \$169,36 | 7 | \$0 | \$250,000 | \$84,684 | \$84,684 | \$84,684 | \$250,000 | \$84,684 | \$78,756 | \$26,677 | \$25,353 | \$8,588 | \$39,123 | \$13,252 | \$8,936,805 | \$3,027,205 | | | \$3,160,406 |
| 2029 | 17 | \$500,00 | 0 \$158,28 | 7 \$158,28 | 7 | \$0 \$0 | \$250,000 | \$79,144 | \$79,144 | \$79,144 | \$250,000 | \$79,144 | \$78,756 | \$24,932 | \$25,353 | \$8,026 | \$39,123 | \$12,385 | \$8,936,805 | \$2,829,164 | 1 | | \$2,953,651 |
| 2030 | 18 | \$500,00 | 0 \$147,93 | 2 \$147,93 | 2 | \$0 | \$250,000 | \$73,966 | \$73,966 | \$73,966 | \$250,000 | \$73,966 | \$78,756 | \$23,301 | \$25,353 | \$7,501 | \$39,123 | \$11,575 | \$8,936,805 | \$2,644,078 | 3 | | \$2,760,421 |
| 2031 | 19 | \$500,00 | 0 \$138,25 | 4 \$138,25 | 4 | \$0 | \$250,000 | \$69,127 | \$69,127 | \$69,127 | \$250,000 | \$69,127 | \$78,756 | \$21,777 | \$25,353 | \$7,010 | \$39,123 | \$10,818 | \$8,936,805 | \$2,471,10 | | | \$2,579,833 |
| 2032 | 20 | \$500,00 | 5129,21 | \$129,21 | 0 | \$0 | \$250,000 | \$64,605 | \$64,605 | \$64,605 | \$250,000 | \$64,605 | \$78,756 | \$20,352 | \$25,353 | \$6,552 | \$39,123 | \$10,110 | \$8,936,805 | \$2,309,440 | ¢17 500 740 | ¢ 4 0 47 40 | \$2,411,059 |
| 2033 | 21 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | \$17,586,742 | \$4,247,420 | \$4,247,428 |
| Total (| undis \$0 | 0 \$10,500,00 | 00 | | \$46,100,000 | | \$5,900,000 | | | | \$4,600,000 |) | \$1,449,108 | | \$466,497 | | | 9 | \$160,862,494 | | | | |
| Discou | nted presen | nt \$0 | \$5,797,00 | 7 \$5,797,00 | 7 | \$43,163,422 | | \$3,510,107 | \$46,673,529 | 9 \$46,673,529 | | \$2,286,900 | | \$720,427 | | \$231,920 | | \$378,357 | | \$78,518,736 | 3 | | \$86,383,768 |

*Assumes residual value at the end of 20 years as calculated in "Revised Benefits" sheet. Net and total costs are equal because the maintenance cost savings are claimed under benefits. This analysis also uses 7% discount rate. Since the primary funding is assumed to be the TIGER grant, which would go to other projects if not this one, than a 3% discount rate can be considered, which would increase the B/C ratio by 55%.

1.85

B/C = based on present value

Benefit and Cost Calculatio Discount rate

| | | | | | | Costs | | | | | | |
|---------|-------|-------------------|--------------|-------------|-------------|--------------|--------------|-------------|-------------|--------------|--------------------|------|
| | | | Base Ca | ise | | | | Project | | | | |
| | | Capital | Mainte | enance | Total | Cap | bital | Mainte | nance | Total | Net Project | Ma |
| Year | | Actual Discounted | Actual | Discounted | Discounted | Actual | Discounted | Actual | Discounted | Discounted | Costs (Discounted) | Actu |
| 2012 | 0 | | \$500,000 | \$500,000 | \$500,000 | \$15,300,000 | \$15,300,000 | \$500,000 | \$500,000 | \$15,800,000 | \$15,800,000 | |
| 2013 | 1 | | \$500,000 | \$485,437 | \$485,437 | \$16,100,000 | \$15,631,068 | \$450,000 | \$436,893 | \$16,067,961 | \$16,067,961 | |
| 2014 | 2 | | \$500,000 | \$471,298 | \$471,298 | \$14,300,000 | \$13,479,122 | \$450,000 | \$424,168 | \$13,903,290 | \$13,903,290 | |
| 2015 | 3 | | \$500,000 | \$457,571 | \$457,571 | \$400,000 | \$366,057 | \$250,000 | \$228,785 | \$594,842 | \$594,842 | |
| 2016 | 4 | | \$500,000 | \$444,244 | \$444,244 | \$0 | \$0 | \$250,000 | \$222,122 | \$222,122 | \$222,122 | |
| 2017 | 5 | | \$500,000 | \$431,304 | \$431,304 | | \$0 | \$250,000 | \$215,652 | \$215,652 | \$215,652 | |
| 2018 | 6 | | \$500,000 | \$418,742 | \$418,742 | | \$0 | \$250,000 | \$209,371 | \$209,371 | \$209,371 | |
| 2019 | 7 | | \$500,000 | \$406,546 | \$406,546 | | \$0 | \$250,000 | \$203,273 | \$203,273 | \$203,273 | |
| 2020 | 8 | | \$500,000 | \$394,705 | \$394,705 | | \$0 | \$250,000 | \$197,352 | \$197,352 | \$197,352 | |
| 2021 | 9 | | \$500,000 | \$383,208 | \$383,208 | | \$0 | \$250,000 | \$191,604 | \$191,604 | \$191,604 | |
| 2022 | 10 | | \$500,000 | \$372,047 | \$372,047 | | \$0 | \$250,000 | \$186,023 | \$186,023 | \$186,023 | |
| 2023 | 11 | | \$500,000 | \$361,211 | \$361,211 | | \$0 | \$250,000 | \$180,605 | \$180,605 | \$180,605 | |
| 2024 | 12 | | \$500,000 | \$350,690 | \$350,690 | | \$0 | \$250,000 | \$175,345 | \$175,345 | \$175,345 | |
| 2025 | 13 | | \$500,000 | \$340,476 | \$340,476 | | \$0 | \$250,000 | \$170,238 | \$170,238 | \$170,238 | |
| 2026 | 14 | | \$500,000 | \$330,559 | \$330,559 | | \$0 | \$250,000 | \$165,279 | \$165,279 | \$165,279 | |
| 2027 | 15 | | \$500,000 | \$320,931 | \$320,931 | | \$0 | \$250,000 | \$160,465 | \$160,465 | \$160,465 | |
| 2028 | 16 | | \$500,000 | \$311,583 | \$311,583 | | \$0 | \$250,000 | \$155,792 | \$155,792 | \$155,792 | |
| 2029 | 17 | | \$500,000 | \$302,508 | \$302,508 | | \$0 | \$250,000 | \$151,254 | \$151,254 | \$151,254 | |
| 2030 | 18 | | \$500,000 | \$293,697 | \$293,697 | | \$0 | \$250,000 | \$146,849 | \$146,849 | \$146,849 | |
| 2031 | 19 | | \$500,000 | \$285,143 | \$285,143 | | \$0 | \$250,000 | \$142,572 | \$142,572 | \$142,572 | |
| 2032 | 20 | | \$500,000 | \$276,838 | \$276,838 | | \$0 | \$250,000 | \$138,419 | \$138,419 | \$138,419 | |
| 2033 | 21 | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Total (| undis | \$0 | \$10,500,000 | | | \$46,100,000 | | \$5,900,000 | | | | \$ |
| Discou | nted | present \$0 | 1 | \$7,938,737 | \$7,938,737 | | \$44,776,246 | | \$4,602,063 | \$49,378,309 | \$49,378,309 | |

3% per year

| Benefits | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|-------------|---------------------------------------|-------------|-------------|--------------|------------|--------------|-------------|---------------|---------------|--------------|---------------|---------------|
| | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Maintenance | Maintenance Cost Savings Time Savings | | Fuel S | Fuel Savings | | Savings | Job Savings | | Residua | l Valye | Total Savings | |
| Actual | Discounted | Actual | Discounted | Actual | Discounted | Actual | Discounted | Actual | Discounted | Actual [| Discounted | (Discounted) |
| \$0 |) \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | | | \$0 |
| \$50,000 | \$48,544 | \$15,751 | \$15,292 | \$5,071 | \$4,923 | \$12,911 | \$12,535 | \$0 | \$0 | | | \$81,294 |
| \$50,000 | \$47,130 | \$15,751 | \$14,847 | \$5,071 | \$4,780 | \$25,821 | \$24,339 | \$0 | \$0 | | | \$91,095 |
| \$250,000 | \$228,785 | \$78,756 | \$72,073 | \$25,353 | \$23,202 | \$39,123 | \$35,803 | \$8,936,805 | \$8,178,443 | | | \$8,538,306 |
| \$250,000 | \$222,122 | \$78,756 | \$69,974 | \$25,353 | \$22,526 | \$39,123 | \$34,761 | \$8,936,805 | \$7,940,236 | | | \$8,289,617 |
| \$250,000 | \$215,652 | \$78,756 | \$67,935 | \$25,353 | \$21,870 | \$39,123 | \$33,748 | \$8,936,805 | \$7,708,967 | | | \$8,048,172 |
| \$250,000 | \$209,371 | \$78,756 | \$65,957 | \$25,353 | \$21,233 | \$39,123 | \$32,765 | \$8,936,805 | \$7,484,434 | | | \$7,813,760 |
| \$250,000 | \$203,273 | \$78,756 | \$64,036 | \$25,353 | \$20,614 | \$39,123 | \$31,811 | \$8,936,805 | \$7,266,440 | | | \$7,586,174 |
| \$250,000 | \$197,352 | \$78,756 | \$62,171 | \$25,353 | \$20,014 | \$39,123 | \$30,884 | \$8,936,805 | \$7,054,797 | | | \$7,365,218 |
| \$250,000 | \$191,604 | \$78,756 | \$60,360 | \$25,353 | \$19,431 | \$39,123 | \$29,985 | \$8,936,805 | \$6,849,317 | | | \$7,150,697 |
| \$250,000 | \$186,023 | \$78,756 | \$58,602 | \$25,353 | \$18,865 | \$39,123 | \$29,111 | \$8,936,805 | \$6,649,822 | | | \$6,942,424 |
| \$250,000 | \$180,605 | \$78,756 | \$56,895 | \$25,353 | \$18,316 | \$39,123 | \$28,264 | \$8,936,805 | \$6,456,138 | | | \$6,740,218 |
| \$250,000 | \$175,345 | \$78,756 | \$55,238 | \$25,353 | \$17,782 | \$39,123 | \$27,440 | \$8,936,805 | \$6,268,095 | | | \$6,543,901 |
| \$250,000 | \$170,238 | \$78,756 | \$53,629 | \$25,353 | \$17,264 | \$39,123 | \$26,641 | \$8,936,805 | \$6,085,529 | | | \$6,353,302 |
| \$250,000 | \$165,279 | \$78,756 | \$52,067 | \$25,353 | \$16,761 | \$39,123 | \$25,865 | \$8,936,805 | \$5,908,281 | | | \$6,168,254 |
| \$250,000 | \$160,465 | \$78,756 | \$50,550 | \$25,353 | \$16,273 | \$39,123 | \$25,112 | \$8,936,805 | \$5,736,195 | | | \$5,988,596 |
| \$250,000 | \$155,792 | \$78,756 | \$49,078 | \$25,353 | \$15,799 | \$39,123 | \$24,380 | \$8,936,805 | \$5,569,122 | | | \$5,814,171 |
| \$250,000 | \$151,254 | \$78,756 | \$47,649 | \$25,353 | \$15,339 | \$39,123 | \$23,670 | \$8,936,805 | \$5,406,914 | | | \$5,644,826 |
| \$250,000 | \$146,849 | \$78,756 | \$46,261 | \$25,353 | \$14,892 | \$39,123 | \$22,981 | \$8,936,805 | \$5,249,431 | | | \$5,480,414 |
| \$250.000 | \$142.572 | \$78,756 | \$44,913 | \$25,353 | \$14,459 | \$39,123 | \$22.311 | \$8,936,805 | \$5.096.535 | | | \$5.320.790 |
| \$250,000 | \$138,419 | \$78,756 | \$43.605 | \$25.353 | \$14.037 | \$39,123 | \$21.662 | \$8.936.805 | \$4,948,092 | | | \$5.165.816 |
| + | ••••• | | •••• | + | •••,••• | *** , | +, | | • .,• .•,••= | \$17.586.742 | \$9.453.740 | \$9.453.740 |
| | | 1 | | | | | | | | , , , , | • • • • • • • | +-,, - |
| \$4,600,000 |) | \$1,449,108 | | \$466,497 | | | | \$160,862,494 | | | | |
| | \$3,336,675 | | \$1,051,131 | | \$338,380 | | \$544,069 | | \$115,856,789 | | | \$130,580,783 |

*Assumes residual value at the end of 20 years as calculated in "Revised Benefits" sheet.

Net and total costs are equal because the maintenance cost savings are claimed under benefits. This alternative case analysis uses 3% discount rate since the primary funding is assumed to be the TIGER grant, which would go to other public projects if not this one.

2.64

B/C = based on present value

Residual Value

| Residual vale | | | | | | | | | |
|---------------|--------------|-------------|--------------|---------------------------------------|--|--|--|--|--|
| Component | Value | % Life Left | Residual | Notes | | | | | |
| Right-of-way | \$0 | 100% | \$0 | No ROW was needed | | | | | |
| Earthwork | \$10,072,852 | 80% | \$8,058,282 | Estimated as fraction of total cost | | | | | |
| Structures | \$15,880,767 | 60% | \$9,528,460 | Estimated as fraction of total cost | | | | | |
| Total | \$25,953,619 | | \$17,586,742 | Claim as benefit at beginning of 2033 | | | | | |

Residual Value after 20 Years

Earthwork on Beartooth cost \$10,072,851.85

Structures on Beartooth cost \$15,880,767.00

No ROW, value of land is all Forest Service land outside of Yellowstone but we are within the easement.

Beartooth Construction Costs

| | Spending | | | | | | | | | | |
|---------|----------|------------|--------------------|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| Q1 2012 | \$ | - | January - March | | | | | | | | |
| Q2 2012 | \$ | 2,500,000 | April - June | | | | | | | | |
| Q3 2012 | \$ | 3,500,000 | July-September | | | | | | | | |
| Q4 2012 | \$ | 9,300,000 | October - December | | | | | | | | |
| Q1 2013 | \$ | 400,000 | January - March | | | | | | | | |
| Q2 2013 | \$ | 2,900,000 | April - June | | | | | | | | |
| Q3 2013 | \$ | 3,500,000 | July-September | | | | | | | | |
| Q4 2013 | \$ | 9,300,000 | October - December | | | | | | | | |
| Q1 2014 | \$ | 400,000 | January - March | | | | | | | | |
| Q2 2014 | \$ | 2,900,000 | April - June | | | | | | | | |
| Q3 2014 | \$ | 3,000,000 | July-September | | | | | | | | |
| Q4 2014 | \$ | 8,000,000 | October - December | | | | | | | | |
| Q1 2015 | \$ | 400,000 | January - March | | | | | | | | |
| | \$ | 46,100,000 | | | | | | | | | |

Estimate of Annual Benefits

| Final | |
|--|---|
| 4.71 miles | |
| 1.016 CPI inflator from 2011 to mid point of 2012 (half of 2011 inflation) | |
| 1578 vpd, effectively constant because of low growth | |
| 146 days per year of benefits | |
| 42 mph | |
| 47 mph | |
| \$28.65 per hour, assume 1.5 wage earners per car; occupancy ~2.6 | \$19.10 Use \$18 from TIGER BENEFIT-COST ANALYSIS (BCA) RESOURCE GUIDE, p. 4, inflated from |
| \$0.48 per minute of time savings | |
| 6.728571429 min initial travel time | |
| 6.012765957 min after travel time | |
| 0.715805471 savings (min) | |
| 0.011930091 savings (hours per vehicle) | |
| 2,749 hours per year 18.8 hrs/day | |
| \$78,756 per year | |
| 20 life without overlays | |
| \$1,575,117 20-yr time cost savings | |
| 0.0084 fuel gallon savings per vehicle | |
| 1,932 total fuel savings per year | |
| \$25,353 fuel cost savings per year | |
| 39,728 Ib of GHG/yr, based on 5% diesel (22.2 lb CO2/gal) and 95% gasoline | (19.4 lb CO2/gal), with 5% added to CO2 to account for other GHG. |
| 20 tons of GHG saved/yr <u>http://www.ep</u> a | a.gov/otaq/climate/420f05001.htm |
| 397 tons of GHG saved/20 years (no value assigned) <u>http://www.epa</u> | a.gov/OMS/climate/420f05004.htm |
| \$250,000 Fatimated annual maintanenes aget as in re | |
| \$250,000 Estimated annual maintenance cost savings | |
| \$250,000 per year adjusting for no overlay costs | |
| \$354,109 Total annual benefits of maintenance savings, time, and fuel savings | |
| | |
| 0.95 acc/mvm (assumed "before" rate) | |
| 0.5415 acc/mvm (assumed "after" rate | |
| 1 08512748 annual mym | |
| $0.44 \text{ accidents saved per year} \qquad 27.0712571$ | |
| 1.44 accidents saved per year 27.0712371 | |
| \$88,260 Cost per accident (see accident cost tabassumes no ratainties) | |
| \$39,123 Annual accident cost savings | |
| \$39,123 Average accident savings between now and future | |
| \$393,232 Total annual benefits of maintenance savings, time, fuel, and accident | savings |
| \$8,936,805 Job loss avoidance (see "Carbon County Tourist Jobs" tab) | |
| | |

\$9,330,037 Total annual project benefit

m 2008 to midpoint o

Valuation of accident data

KABCO - AIS Conversion

KABCO codes

| 0 = No Injury | 3 = Incapacitating Injury | | | | |
|-------------------------------|---------------------------|--|--|--|--|
| 1 = Possible Injury | 4 = Fatal | | | | |
| 2 = Non-Incapacitating Injury | | | | | |

| Codes = | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 |
|---------|---|---|---|---|
| | | | | |

KABCO-AIS Conversion Table (Excluding Fatalities in Non-Fatal Injury Codes)

| | Ο | С | В | Α | к | Injured | Unknown |
|----------|-----------|----------|------------------------|----------------|--------|---------------------|------------|
| | No Injury | Poss Inj | Non- Incapacitating | Incapacitating | Killed | Severity Unknown | If Injured |
| AIS 0 | 0.92534 | 0.23437 | 0.08347 | 0.03437 | 0 | 0.21538 | 0.43676 |
| AIS 1 | 0.07257 | 0.68946 | 0.76843 | 0.55449 | 0 | 0.62728 | 0.41739 |
| AIS 2 | 0.00198 | 0.06391 | 0.10898 | 0.20908 | 0 | 0.104 | 0.08872 |
| AIS 3 | 0.00008 | 0.01071 | 0.03191 | 0.14437 | 0 | 0.03858 | 0.04817 |
| AIS 4 | 0 | 0.00142 | 0.0062 | 0.03986 | 0 | 0.00442 | 0.00617 |
| AIS 5 | 0.00003 | 0.00013 | 0.00101 | 0.01783 | 0 | 0.01034 | 0.00279 |
| Fatality | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 |

Source: NHTSA, July 2011.

from p. 50308 Federal Register / Vol. 76, No. 156 / Friday, August 12, 2011 / Notices

Relative Disutility Factors by Injury Severity Level (AIS) For Use with 3% or 7% Discount Rate

| AIS Level | Severity | Fraction of VSL |
|-----------|--------------|-----------------|
| AIS 1 | Minor | 0.003 |
| AIS 2 | Moderate | 0.047 |
| AIS 3 | Serious | 0.105 |
| AIS 4 | Severe | 0.266 |
| AIS 5 | Critical | 0.593 |
| AIS 6 | Unsurvivable | 1 |

Notice of Funding Availability for the Department of Transportation's National Infrastructure Investments Under the Full-Year Continuing Appropriations, 2011; and Request for Comments

| Treatment of the Economic Value of a Statistical Life in | | 2011 \$ | 2012 \$ |
|--|-------------|---------------|---|
| Departmental Analyses – 2011 Interim Adjustment | Gives VSL = | \$6.2 million | \$6,297,852 million from p. 2 of T |

| MEMORANDUM TO: SECRETA | ARIAL OFFICERS | [SIGNED July 29, 2011] |
|--------------------------------------|----------------------|---|
| MODAL ADMINISTRATORS | | |
| From: Polly Trottenberg, Assista p.3 | ant Secretary for Tr | ansportation Policy |
| value-of-life-guidance.pdf | from: | http://ostpxweb.dot.gov/policy/reports.htm Accessed: 9/30/11 |

PDO Valuation

\$3,442 from p. 2 of TIGER BCA guidance, inflated from 2011 to mid point 2012 by 50% of 2011 CPI change for all urban consumers.

Don't know breakdown for Bear Tooth so assume unknown if injured for sample accident based on PDO and VSL values above:

| 1 | | | | |
|--------------------|--------------|-------------|--------------------------------------|--|
| For unknown if inj | Fraction VSL | Value | Total | |
| 0.43676 | N/A | \$3,442 | \$1,503 | |
| 0.41739 | 0.003 | \$18,894 | \$7,886 | |
| 0.08872 | 0.047 | \$295,999 | \$26,261 | |
| 0.04817 | 0.105 | \$661,275 | \$31,854 | |
| 0.00617 | 0.266 | \$1,675,229 | \$10,336 | |
| 0.00279 | 0.593 | \$3,734,626 | \$10,420 | |
| 0 | 1 | \$6,297,852 | \$0 Note: this assumes no fatalities | |
| | | | \$88,260 | |

Carbon County, Montana, Jobs for Estimation of Income Effects of Reduced Tourist Access

| | | | Sources of 2009 Update: T1. Population Estimates [11] | | | | |
|--------------------|--|---------------------------|---|---|--|--|--|
| | | | | | | | |
| | 2000 Census | 2009 Update | Data Set: 2009 Population Estimates | | | | |
| Household data | 9,552 people | 2009 9,75 | 6 http://factfine | der.census.gov/servlet/DTTable?_bm=y&-context=dt&-ds_name= | | | |
| | 4,065 households | 3,97 | 4 ACS 2009 http://factfine | der.census.gov/servlet/DTTable?_bm=y&-context=dt&-ds_name= | | | |
| | \$32,139 median income per household | \$50,67 | 6 median income per househol | d, 2009 \$ | | | |
| | | | B 9013. MEDIAN HOUSEHO | DLD INCOME IN THE PAST 12 MONTHS (IN 2009 INFLATION-A | | | |
| | | | Data Set: 2005-2009 American Community Survey 5-Year Estimates Survey: American Community Survey | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | B11001. HOUSEHOLD TYPE | E (INCLUDING LIVING ALONE) - Universe: HOUSEHOLDS | | | |
| | | | Data Set: 2005-2009 America | an Community Survey 5-Year Estimates | | | |
| | | | Survey: American Community | y Survey | | | |
| | | | http://factfinder.census.gov/se | ervlet/DTTable?_bm=y&-context=dt&-ds_name=ACS_2009_5YR | | | |
| Assume With mul | that 1/3 of Carbon County jobs supplies income to 1/3 of hou tiplier, up to 50% of households could be affected. | iseholds | CPI | | | | |
| | Adjusting the 2009 median income to 2012 \$ via CPI = | \$53,97 | 2 1.065 I | nflator 2009 - 2012 from annual unadjusted CPI for all urban cons | | | |
| | | . , | 214.537 | 2009 | | | |
| | Do it in both 2000 and 2012 \$ | | 224.939 | 2011 | | | |
| | 2000 \$ | 2012 \$ | | | | | |
| | \$43,548,345 Annual income of 33% of households | \$71,494,44 | 2 | | | | |
| | \$65,322,518 Annual income of 50% of households | \$107,241,66 | 3 | | | | |
| | So income from jobs are dependent on the highway is \$70 |) to \$105 million per ye | ar in 2012 \$ | | | | |
| | Assume 10% loss of average (mid point) of range = | \$8,936,80 | 5 | | | | |
| | | • | | | | | |

This assumes that there is a 10% loss in income from the tourist dependent jobs if the highway continues to deteriorate due to larger vehicles using other routes and lower overall traffic for smaller vehicles. Assumption is conservative: Mariposa, CA, lost more like 1/3 of income from SR 140 vehicle restriction with temporary bridge. =PEP_2009_EST&-mt_name=PEP_2009_EST_G2009_T0(=ACS_2009_5YR_G00_&-mt_name=ACS_2009_5YR_G20

ADJUSTED DOLLARS) - Universe: HOUSEHOLDS

G00&-mt_name=ACS_2009_5YR_G2000_B11001&-CO

sumers, assuming mid point 2012 (updated 2/28/12)

Income Data for Consideration of Economic Distress

ACS not accurate for small area due to large sample error, use 2000 Census data:

| Median Household Income - Park | County, WY, censu | us tract and bloc | nd block group | | | n | | | |
|--------------------------------|-------------------|-------------------|-------------------------|---------|----------|---------|--------------------------------------|--|--|
| | 2009 \$ | | 1999 \$ | | 2009 \$ | | Souce (from P53 table) | | |
| Zone | ACS 2009 | % of US | 2000 Census | % of US | | | 9/15/2011 | | |
| CT 9953 | \$51,203 | 1029 | <mark>% \$40,008</mark> | 79.9% | \$51,520 | | http://factfinder.census.gov/servlet | | |
| CT 9951 | \$52,601 | 1059 | % \$43,674 | 87% | \$56,241 | | | | |
| CT 9953 remainder of Cody CDP | \$51,386 | 1029 | % \$40,302 | 80.5% | \$51,898 | | 9/15/2011 | | |
| CT 9953 Block group 2 | N/A | | \$39,350 | 78.6% | \$50,672 | | http://factfinder.census.gov/servlet | | |
| Zip 82435 | N/A | | \$41,609 | 83% | \$53,581 | | | | |
| Zip 82414 | N/A | | \$41,691 | 83% | \$53,687 | | | | |
| US | \$50,221 | 1009 | % \$50,046 | 100% | \$64,446 | | | | |
| | | | | | 2009 CPI | 214.537 | 1.287737 | | |
| | | | | | 1999 CPI | 166.6 | | | |

P53. MEDIAN HOUSEHOLD INCOME IN 1999 (DOLLARS) [1] -Universe: Households Data Set: Census 2000 Summary File 3 (SF 3) - Sample Data

NOTE: Data based on a sample except in P3, P4, H3, and H4. For information on confidentiality protection, sampling error, nonsampling error, definitions, and count corrections see http://factfinder.census.gov/home/ en/datanotes/expsf3.htm.

 Block Group 2, Census Tract 9953, Park County, Wyoming

 Median household income in 1999
 39,350

U.S. Census Bureau Census 2000

Fuel Efficiency

p. 5-12 AASHTO, User Benerfit Analysis for Highways, August 2003.

| mph | Ga | allons per utos | Mile Trucks | Average with 5% trucks | | Over 4.71 miles | Cost/mi | Updated 2/27/12 Total Cost | |
|-----|----|--------------------|----------------------|------------------------|--------|--|---------|--|-------------|
| | 40 | 0.044 | 0.176 | | | | | | |
| | 42 | 0.0432 | 0.1736 interpolation | 0.04972 | | 0.234181 | \$0.17 | \$3.09 | |
| | 45 | 0.042 | 0.17 | | | | | | |
| | 47 | 0.0416 | 0.1684 interpolation | 0.04794 | | 0.225797 | \$0.16 | \$2.98 | |
| | 50 | 0.041 | 0.166 | | | | | | |
| | | | | av | verage | 0.008384 gal per vehicle saved \$0.027 cost savings per vehic | | I \$0.110 to account for different gas and die | esel prices |

Use 2/27/12 gasoline and diesel cost from Energy Information Administration for Rocky Mountain Region \$3.20 for regular gas \$3.92 for diesel